

**WILLIAMSBURG
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MINUTES
Tuesday, December 14, 2004**

CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

The regular semimonthly Architectural Review Board meeting was held on Tuesday, December 14, 2004, at 6:30 p.m. in the third Floor Conference Room of the Municipal Building.

Chairman Williams called the meeting to order. Present in addition to Mr. Williams were Board members Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Walker, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson. None were absent. Also present was Zoning Administrator Murphy and Zoning Officer Beck.

CONSENT AGENDA

- | | |
|-----------------------------|---|
| ARB #04-110 | Williams/516 Newport Avenue – Addition to Single-Family Dwelling – Approved. |
| ARB #04-116 | Maceo Lodge/700 South Henry Street – Fence – Approved. |
| ARB #04-117 | Montessori School/420 Scotland Street – Exterior Change (Roof over stoop) – Approved. |
| ARB #04-120 | Shirley/705 Hamilton Street – Demolition (Garage) – Approved. |
| ARB #04-118 | Wyndham Plantation/105 Zelkova Road – Exterior Change (Hot Tub) – Approved. |
| ARB #04-121 | Bank of Williamsburg/171 Monticello Avenue – Exterior Change (ATM) – Approved. |
| ARB
SIGN #04-049 | Fed Ex/Kinko's/1250 Richmond Road – Building Mounted Signs – Approved. |
| ARB
SIGN #04-050 | Bank of Williamsburg/171 Monticello Avenue – Monument Building Mounted Signs – Approved. |
| ARB
SIGN #04-051 | Fantastic Sams/151 Monticello Avenue – Building Mounted Sign – Approved. |

Ms. Murphy informed the Board an application had been submitted for Fantastic Sams (ARB SIGN #04-051) at Williamsburg Shopping Center with white lettering and bronze returns to match other signs in the shopping center and asked if it could be added to the consent agenda since the next meeting would not be until the middle of January. The Board reviewed the proposed sign and agreed to add it to the consent agenda.

Mr. Williams motioned to approve the consent agenda as presented with the addition of ARB SIGN #04-051.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Walker, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson.
Nay: None.
Absent: None.
Abstain: None.

ARCHITECTURAL PRESERVATION DISTRICT

ARB #04-115 Murphy/434 South Henry Street – Demolition of Single-Family Dwelling & Construction of New Single-Family Dwelling, Detached Garage & Fencing

Dave Harvey, contractor, and Trinh Murphy, owner, presented plans for the demolition of the single-family dwelling and the construction of a new single-family dwelling, detached garage and fencing. Mr. Harvey noted the following:

- He met Edward Chappell, Architectural Historian with Colonial Williamsburg Foundation and Carolyn Murphy, Zoning Administrator to determine the condition of the dwelling and its history.
- The dwelling was in poor condition as noted from the inspection report prepared by John P. Lynch which had been submitted with the application.
- The original portion of the dwelling had been added to substantially, which diminishes its historical value.
- Repairing the dwelling would be expensive due to its current condition.

Mr. Williams asked if the dwelling could be relocated and if the Williamsburg Housing Authority would be interested in relocating the dwelling. Mr. Harvey noted the owner had not contacted anyone about relocating the dwelling, but she would be in favor of its relocation if someone was interested in the dwelling. Jim Gurganus, WRHA Director, stated he would take a look at the dwelling to determine if the Housing Authority was interested in its relocation.

Mr. Klee noted the following:

- He inspected the dwelling with Mr. Chappell and Ms. Murphy because the shape of the original portion of the dwelling may be from the 18th Century which would make the dwelling valuable because of the small number of 18th Century structures in the City.
- The inspection revealed the dwelling was constructed at the turn of the 20th Century.
- The dwelling is on the list of Local Significant Architecture because the area where this dwelling is located was a neighborhood where the black working-class lived in the City.

- These modest dwellings are a fragile example of their time in history and are usually the first to be demolished during redevelopment.
- A majority of these structures have been demolished in this neighborhood.
- Additions to original dwellings do not make those dwellings less valuable, in fact it makes the dwellings more valuable because it provides a history of the dwelling.
- It will be sad to demolish it, but it would also be difficult to argue in favor of not demolishing it because of the lost character of the neighborhood. In addition, the area is being reviewed by Planning Commission for redevelopment.

Mr. Hertzler stated that the Planning Commission is reviewing this area as part of their Comprehensive Plan update process and consideration is being given to increasing the area's density for redevelopment. He also noted that he would be in favor of demolition due to its poor condition and because it is the only dwelling from the turn-of-the-century remaining in the block.

Mr. Durbin stated he would be in favor of demolition since relocating the dwelling would be near impossible.

Board members asked Ms. Murphy why the dwelling was demolished next door. She stated it was approved for demolition because of poor maintenance and severe termite infestation.

Trinh Murphy stated the inspection of the dwelling at 434 South Henry Street revealed an infestation of termites along the left wall of the addition.

Mr. Spence stated he would not be in favor of demolition because he thinks the dwelling is in fairly good condition, and he wants to remain consistent with previous votes to deny demolition of dwellings along South Henry Street.

Mr. Walker stated he was not in favor of allowing demolition of historic houses, but since City Council overturned the Architectural Review Board's last decision for demolition in this area, and because Planning Commission is looking at redeveloping this area, he would need a very good reason to not allow the demolition of this dwelling.

Andrew Edwards, 800 South Henry Street, noted the following:

- He has lived on South Henry Street over the past 13 years and during that time many of the pre-War World II dwellings have slowly disappeared in this area.
- The owners of these dwelling have died and the dwellings have become rentals which are not well maintained.

- He would hate to see another historic dwelling demolished, but if approved, he would like to see a dwelling of similar size and architecture to other dwellings in the neighborhood constructed on the property.

John Millar, 710 S Henry St, concurred with Mr. Edwards and added that even if the dwelling is moved it would lose 90% of its historic value because it will lose its context.

Mr. Watson agreed the replacement should be in keeping with the community, and was in favor of the demolition.

Mr. Williams asked Mr. Harvey to review the proposed single-family dwelling to replace the existing dwelling. Mr. Harvey noted the replacement dwelling would be constructed of brick, architectural-grade shingles, windows with exterior muntins and concrete, exposed ground gutters as shown on the proposed drawings.

Bob Lyons, 800 South Henry Street, stated he liked the small scale of the proposed dwelling and its front elevation; however the sides are not attractive and should be in keeping with the front elevation. Mr. Harvey noted landscaping is proposed along the side of the dwelling to soften the appearance of the proposed dwelling.

Mr. Williams motioned to approve the demolition, new dwelling, detached garage and fencing for ARB #04-115 conditioned upon the following:

1. The Williamsburg Redevelopment and Housing Authority having the opportunity to inspect the dwelling and determine if they would be interested in relocating it to another neighborhood.
2. Colonial Williamsburg's Architectural Historians being given the opportunity to document the historical significance of the dwelling.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Walker and Mr. Watson.

Nay: Mr. Spence.

Absent: None.

Abstain: None.

ARB #04-119 WRHA/719 Lafayette Street – New Single-Family Dwelling

Jim Gurganus, Williamsburg Redevelopment and Housing Authority, Director presented plans for a new single-family dwelling noting the following:

- The proposed dwelling is modeled after a dwelling being constructed in the Strawberry Plains subdivision.

- It will contain a brick foundation, white vinyl siding, architectural grade shingles, single-hung, double pane, vinyl clad windows with no muntins.
- There will be a detached garage in the back, and a natural stain wooden picket fence.
- He provided a sample of the proposed white vinyl siding for the Board to review in accordance with the ***Design Review Guidelines*** which allows a gauge of 0.42 thickness for vinyl siding in **Zone 3** of the **Architectural Preservation District**.

Mr. Walker motioned to approve ARB #04-119 as presented.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Walker, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson.

Nay: None.

Absent: None.

Abstain: None.

OTHER BUSINESS

Minutes November 23, 2004

The minutes were approved as presented.

Annual Report

Mr. Williams motioned to approve as presented the Annual Report for 2004.

Recorded vote on the motion:

Aye: Mr. Klee, Mr. Hertzler, Mr. Durbin, Mr. Williams, Mr. Walker, Mr. Spence and Mr. Watson.

Nay: None.

Absent: None.

Abstain: None.

Letter to City Council

The Board discussed and approved a letter to City Council on synthetic siding. Mr. Hertzler stated he spoke to Jack Tuttle, City Manager, who was supportive of the Preservation Medallion idea noted in the letter.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:15 P.M.

Jason Beck
Zoning Officer